AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	
V.	Civil Action No.
RAJESH PATEL,	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
Defendant.	

## <u>Defendant's Motion for Sanctions for Mark Lutz's Failure to Appear at his</u> <u>Deposition</u>

COMES NOW, Rajesh Patel, by and through counsel, filing this Defendant's

#### Motion for Sanctions for Mark Lutz's Failure to Appear at his Deposition,

requesting the following relief pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 37(b)(2)(A) and (d):

- (a) An order directing that Plaintiff be prohibited from opposing Defendant's motions for sanctions (ECF # 16, 30); and
- (b) An order directing that the following facts are deemed admitted in this action: (1) The assignment agreement at issue in this case contains the forged signature of Alan Cooper and Raymond Rogers;
- (c) An order granting further discovery in order to obtain the deposition of Mr. Lutz until it is obtained;
- (d) An order dismissing Plaintiff's motions for sanctions (ECF # 20, 21);

- (e) An order treating Mr. Lutz's failure to appear at the deposition as a contempt of Court and requiring Plaintiff and Plaintiff's counsel to pay \$500 per day until Mr. Lutz purges himself of contempt by appearing at a deposition scheduled between the parties' attorneys; and
- (f) An order awarding attorneys' fees and expenses incurred in connection with Defense counsel attending the scheduled deposition, costs of hiring a court reporter, and any other related attorneys' fees and expenses.

Respectfully Submitted September 5, 2013:

/s/ Blair Chintella

Blair Chintella GA Bar No. 510109 2483 Shoals Ter. Decatur, GA 30034 (404) 579-9668 No fax. bchintel1@gmail.com

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	: : : Civil Action No.
V.	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
	:
RAJESH PATEL,	:
Defendant.	

#### **Memorandum of Law**

On July 22, 2013, Defendant served a Notice of Deposition of Mark Lutz on Plaintiff, ECF # 43, a true and correct copy of which are located at ECF # 44-2, and the deposition was to take place on August 21, 2013. Mr. Lutz did not attend his deposition, as shown by the attached transcript of attached hereto.

#### **Argument and Citation to Authority**

A court may, on motion, award sanctions if "a party or a party's officer, director, or managing agent, . . . fails, after being served with proper notice, to appear for that person's deposition." Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 37(d)(1)(A)(i). If a Courts finds that sanctions are appropriate, it can impose the sanctions set forth by Rule 37(b)(2)(A)(i) to (vi). Also, instead of or in addition, it must award expenses and reasonable attorneys' fees to the party that noticed the deposition against the non-compliant "party or attorney . . . or both." Rule 37(a)(5). A failure to attend is not excused on the grounds that the discovery sought was objectionable. Rule 37(d)(2). Before utilizing Rule 37(d), the moving party must make a good faith attempt to confer with the party failing to produce the discovery. Rule 37(d)(1)(B).

Here, Defendant served a notice to depose Mark Lutz and Mr. Lutz failed to attend his deposition. Defense counsel called Plaintiff's counsel multiple times to resolve this issue but never received a response, and still has not received a response regarding Mr. Lutz's non-attendance. Therefore, an order sanctioning as described in the attached proposed order would be appropriate here. Also, sanctions including expenses and attorneys' fees against Plaintiff, Plaintiff's attorney, and Mr. Lutz jointly and severally would be appropriate.

#### **Conclusion**

Mr. Lutz refused to attend his own deposition despite a notice of the deposition being properly served. Therefore, sanctions including attorneys' fees and expense are appropriate here.

Respectfully Submitted September 5, 2013:

/s/ Blair Chintella

Blair Chintella 510109 2483 Shoals Ter. Casse 213255800262/04/C20150 dbu05e2rt 7763, Dilet 1009/08/8-3, Prage 5 off 20

Decatur, GA 30034 404-579-9668 No fax. bchintel1@gmail.com

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	
V.	: Civil Action No.
	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
RAJESH PATEL,	:
	:
Defendant.	:

# Local Rule 7.1(D) Certification

I hereby certify that Defendant's Motion for Sanctions for Mark Lutz's

Failure to Appear at his Deposition and the accompanying Memorandum of

Law comply with LR 5.1B.

Dated September 5, 2013:

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/ Blair Chintella

Blair Chintella GA Bar No. 510109 2483 Shoals Ter. Decatur, GA 30034 (404) 579-9668 bchintel1@gmail.com

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	
V.	Civil Action No.
	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
RAJESH PATEL,	:
	:
Defendant.	:

# FRCP 37(a)(1) and LR 37.1 Certification

I hereby certify that on the dates described in the attached declaration I tried to meet and confer with counsel for Plaintiff to discuss Mr. Lutz's non-attendance at his deposition but never received a response.

Dated September 5, 2013:

Respectfully Submitted:

<u>/s/ Blair Chintella</u>

Blair Chintella GA Bar No. 510109 2483 Shoals Ter. Decatur, GA 30034 (404) 579-9668 No fax. bchintel1@gmail.com

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	
V.	: Civil Action No.
	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
RAJESH PATEL,	:
	:
Defendant.	

# **Certificate of Service**

I hereby certify that on September 5, 2013, I served Defendant's Motion

for Sanctions for Mark Lutz's Failure to Appear at his Deposition on Plaintiff

by filing it through the CM/ECF, which will notify Jacques Nazaire, attorney for

Plaintiff.

Dated September 5, 2013:

Respectfully Submitted:

/s/ Blair Chintella

Blair Chintella GA Bar No. 510109 2483 Shoals Ter. Decatur, GA 30034 (404) 579-9668 No fax. <u>bchintel1@gmail.com</u>

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	: : : Civil Action No.
V.	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
	:
RAJESH PATEL,	:
	:
Defendant.	:

#### **Declaration of Blair Chintella**

1. On August 21, 2013, I called Jacques Nazaire on both numbers and left voicemails that I have for him to determine why Mark Lutz did not attend his deposition but as of September 5, 2013 I have yet to receive a response. I have sent multiple e-mails seeking to talk about discovery in general but have not received a response.

2. I have been licensed to practice law since approximately June of 2009.

3. It states on my retainer agreement(s) with Mr. Patel that my hourly rate is \$200.

4. I spent 2.1 hours in preparing this motion, including creating a rough draft, proofreading, revising, and drafting and doing the same for all attachments.

5. I spent .4 hours converting the documents to PDF format and preparing them to be filed via the CM/ECF system.

6. I spent .2 hours logging into the CM/ECF system to file the

1

documents.

7. I spent a total of 8.6 hours preparing for Mr. Lutz's deposition, including:

- a. 4.5 hours drafting sample questions, which includes an initial draft, revising and proofreading, categorizing so the questions flow topic-to-topic, revising again, and creating a compacted outline by major topics to supplement the multi-page list of specific questions to ask; rehearsing.
- b. 2.1 hours reviewing court documents (especially the deposition of AF Holdings's representative Paul Hansmeier) in the California Action described in Defendant's motion for sanctions (ECF #16) for prior depositions or testimony regarding AF Holdings or Mark Lutz;
- c. 1 hour reviewing Mr. Lutz's purported affidavits filed in cases such as the Sunlust Action and California Action).
- d. 1 hour time travelling to and from the State Bar of Georgia where the deposition was to be held, and including the time spent waiting for the deponent to attend.
- e. The following are some but not all of the expenses associated with scheduling and attempting to conduct the deposition of Mr. Lutz:
  - i. \$108.70 Wheeler Reporting Company Court reporter.

#### Casse 2.11.2-55/980/2.625/04/CZD 1.5) d Du 19/6/24 7631. D Rifeot 09/405/3.3P agag e 13 of f28

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct:

Signature: <u>/s/ Blair Chintella</u> Date: <u>09/05/2013</u> Blair Chintella



JESH PATEL	August 21, 2
	Pag
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA	1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL:
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA	2 On behalf of the Plaintiff:
	3 NO APPEARANCE
AF HOLDINGS, LLC,	4
Plaintiff,	5 On behalf of the Defendant:
vs.	6 BLAIR CHINTELLA, ESQ.
CIVIL ACTION	
2:12-cv-00262-WCO	7 2483 Shoals Terrace
RAJESH PATEL,	8 Decatur, GA 30034
Defendant.	9 (404) 579-9668
*****	10 bchintell@gmail.com
Deposition of MARK LUTZ, taken by the	12 MR. CHINTELLA: Today is August 21st, 2013,
Defendant, before Olivia A. Virtuoso,	13 at 9:39 a.m., in the deposition of MARK LUTZ, wh
Certified Court Reporter (B-400), 104 Marietta	14 was scheduled for 9 o'clock. And nobody is here
Street, NW, Atlanta, Georgia, on the 21st day	15 except me and the court reporter.
of August, 2013, commencing at approximately	16 We have waited 40 minutes, approximately, and
	17 we're just going to wrap this up.
9:39 a.m.	18 [Whereupon, the court
	19 reporter marked Exhibit
	20 No. B-2 for
***************************************	21 identification.]
WHEELER REPORTING COMPANY, INC.	MR. CHINTELLA: I'd like to introduce into
1600 Northside Drive, Suite 250	23 the record, Lutz Exhibit B-2, which is a Notice of
Atlanta, GA 30318	24 Deposition regarding Mark Lutz, and it was served
404.351.4577	25 Jack Nazaire, attorney for the plaintiff.
Page 2	Paį
INDEX OF EXAMINATIONS	1 And for the record, I did try and call Jack
Page	2 Nazaire twice, one time on each of his numbers th
	3 have and have not gotten a call back.
	4 So with that, we're going to end the
Examination by Mr. Chintella 4	5 deposition for today.
	6 (Deposition concluded]
	7
	8
INDEX OF EXHIBITS	9
Exhibit No. B-2	10
Notice of Deposition	11
	12
	13
	14
	15
	16
	17
	18
	19
	20
	21
	22
	23
	23 24 25

# C25502 112-55/8002 625/04720 1 50 0 Du 19624 7632 D Rilent 199/405/3,3P & Bege 243 co f 25) AF HOLDINGS, LLC v. RAJESH PATEL

	D
1 DISCLOSURE	Page 5
2 STATE OF GEORGIA DEPONENT: 3 COUNTY OF FULTON MARK LUTZ	
<ul> <li>Pursuant to Article 10.B of the Rules and</li> <li>Regulations of the Board of Court Reporting of Judicial Council of Georgia, I make the followir</li> <li>disclosure:</li> <li>I am a Georgia Certified Court Reporter. I am here as an independent contractor for Whe</li> <li>Reporting Company, Inc.</li> <li>Wheeler Reporting Company, Inc. was conta by the offices of Blair Chintella, to provide court reporting services for this deposition. Wheeler Reporting will not be taking this deposition und</li> <li>contract that is prohibited by O.C.G.A. 9-11-28</li> <li>Wheeler Reporting Company, Inc. has no contract/agreement to provide reporting servic.</li> <li>any party to the case, any counsel in the case, reporter or reporting agency from whom a refe</li> </ul>	ng eeler acted tt ler any (C). es with or any
<ul> <li>14 might have been made to cover this deposition</li> <li>15 Wheeler Reporting Company, Inc. will charge its usual and customary rates to all parties in the case, and a financial discount will not be given any party to this litigation.</li> </ul>	n. Je ne
18 Alion Vintures	
OLIVIA VIRTUOSO, CCR #B-400 Certified Court Reporter 21 22 23 24 25	
	Page 6
<ol> <li>CERTIFICATE</li> <li>STATE OF GEORGIA:</li> <li>COUNTY OF FULTON:</li> <li>I hereby certify that the foregoing</li> <li>deposition was taken down, as stated in the cardioxidation of the cardioxidatioxidation of the cardioxidatioxidatio</li></ol>	
<ul> <li>and the colloquies, questions and answers there</li> <li>reduced to the written page under my direction</li> <li>the foregoing transcript is a true and correct re</li> <li>of the evidence given.</li> <li>The above certification is expressly</li> <li>withdrawn and denied upon the disassembly o</li> <li>photocopying of the foregoing transcript, unles</li> <li>disassembly or photocopying is done under the ar</li> <li>of Wheeler Reporting Company, Inc., Certified</li> <li>Reporters, and the signature and original seal</li> <li>attached thereto.</li> <li>I further certify that I am not of kin or</li> <li>counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the</li> <li>regular employ of counsel for any of said partie</li> <li>am I in any way financially interested in the res</li> </ul>	to were i; that cord r s uspices Court is e es, nor
<ul> <li>and the colloquies, questions and answers there</li> <li>reduced to the written page under my direction</li> <li>the foregoing transcript is a true and correct re</li> <li>of the evidence given.</li> <li>The above certification is expressly</li> <li>withdrawn and denied upon the disassembly of</li> <li>photocopying of the foregoing transcript, unles</li> <li>disassembly or photocopying is done under the ai</li> <li>of Wheeler Reporting Company, Inc., Certified</li> <li>Reporters, and the signature and original seal</li> <li>attached thereto.</li> <li>I further certify that I am not of kin or</li> <li>counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the</li> <li>am I in any way financially interested in the rest</li> </ul>	to were i; that cord r s uspices Court is e es, nor

# AF HOLDINGS, LLC v. RAJESH PATEL

MARK LUTZ August 21, 2013

KAJESH PATEL	<u></u>		T	August 21, 2013
	5:7,20;	5:1,6	6:4	nor (1)
[	6:14	discount (1)		6:19
•	certify (2)	5:16	I	Notice (2)
[Whereupon (1)	6:4,17	done (1)		
3:18			identification] (1)	3:23
5.10	charge (1)	6:13	3:21	
Α	5:15	down (1)	Inc (5)	numbers (1)
	CHINTELLA (3)	6:5	- 5:8,9,	4:2
above (1)	3:6,12,	Е	12,15;	0
6:10	22	E		0
APPEARANCE (1)	colloquies (1)	amm (4)	- 6:14	0000 (4)
3:3	6:6	employ (1)	INDEX (2)	OCGA (1)
	Company (5)	6:19	2:1,8	5:11
APPEARANCES (1)	5:8,9,	end (1)	interested (1)	o'clock (1)
3:1	12,15;	4:4	6:20	3:14
approximately (1)	6:14	ESQ (1)	into (1)	OLIVIA (1)
3:16	concluded] (1)	3:6	3:22	6:25
attached (1)	4:6	evidence (1)	introduce (1)	one (1)
6:16		6:9	3:22	4:2
attorney (1)	contacted (1)	EXAMINATIONS (1)		original (1)
3:25	5:9	2:1	J	6:15
August (2)	contract (1)	except (1)		0.10
3:12;	5:11	3:15	Jack (2)	Р
6:22	COUNSEL (4)		3:25;	
	3:1;	Exhibit (2)	4:1	Page (2)
auspices (1)	5:13;	3:19,23	7.1	2:2;6:7
6:13	6:18,19	EXHIBITS (1)	К	parties (2)
В	COUNTY (2)	2:8		• • • •
D	5:3;6:3	expressly (1)	kin (1)	6:18,19
P 2 (2)	court (6)	6:10	6:17	party (1)
B-2 (2)	3:15,		0.17	5:13
3:20,23	18;5:5,	F	L	photocopying (2)
back (1)	7,20;			6:12,13
4:3	6:14	financial (1)	LUTZ (4)	Plaintiff (2)
bchintell@gmailcom (1)		5:16	3:13,	3:2,25
3:10	cover (1)	financially (1)	23,24;	prohibited (1)
behalf (2)	5:14	6:20	5:3	5:11
3:2,5	D	foregoing (3)	0.0	
BLAIR (1)	D	6:4,8,	М	R
3:6		12	171	
Board (1)	day (1)	FULTON (2)	MARK (3)	record (3)
5:5	6:22			3:23;
0.0	Decatur (1)	5:3;6:3	3:13,	4:1;6:8
С	3:8	further (1)	24;5:3	reduced (1)
-	Defendant (1)	6:17	marked (1)	6:7
call (2)	3:5	G	3:19	
4:1,3	denied (1)	G	might (1)	regarding (1)
,	6:11	<b>01</b> (4)	5:14	3:24
caption (1)	Deposition (8)	GA (1)	minutes (1)	regular (1)
6:5	2:10;	3:8	3:16	6:19
case (5)		Georgia (2)		Regulations (1)
5:13,	3:13,24;	5:7;6:2	Ν	5:5
13,16;	4:5,6;	given (2)		reporter (4)
6:18,21	5:10,14;	5:16;	Nazaire (2)	3:15,
CCR-B-400 (1)	6:5	6:9	3:25;	19;5:7,
6:25	direction (1)		4:2	20
certification (1)	6:7	Н	nobody (1)	Reporters (1)
6:10	disassembly (2)			6:15
	6:11,13	hereby (1)	3:14	Reporting (7)
Cortified (2)				
Certified (3)	DISCLOSURE (2)			Reporting (7)

# AF HOLDINGS, LLC v. RAJESH PATEL

<b>KAJESH FATEL</b>			August 21, 2013
E.E 0		5:11	
5:5,8,	VIRTUOSO (1)	5.11	
9,10,12,	6:25		
15;6:14	***		
result (1)	$\mathbf{W}$		
6:20			
	waited (1)		
S	3:16		
	— way (1)		
scheduled (1)	6:20		
3:14	Wheeler (5)		
seal (1)	5:9,10,		
6:15	12,15;		
served (1)	6:14		
3:24	withdrawn (1)		
services (1)	6:11		
5:10	wrap (1)		
Shoals (1)	3:17		
3:7	written (1)		
signature (1)	6:7		
6:15			
STATE (1)	2		
6:2			
stated (1)	2013 (2)		
6:5	3:12;		
0.5	6:22		
Т	21st (1)		
-			
Terrace (1)	22nd (1)		
3:7	6:22		
thereto (2)	2483 (1)		
6:6,16	3:7		
Today (2)	2		
3:12;	3		
4:5			
transcript (2)	30034 (1)		
6:8,12	3:8		
true (1)			
6:8	4		
try (1)			
4:1	40 (1)		
	3:16		
twice (1)	404 (1)		
4:2	3:9		
U			
U	5		
under (2)			
under (2)	579-9668 (1)		
6:7,13	3:9		
unless (1)			
6:12	9		
up (1)			
3:17	9 (1)		
upon (1)	3:14		
6:11	9:39 (1)		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	3:13		
V	9-11-28c (1)		
	J=11-200 (1)		



AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:	
Disintiff	1	
Plaintiff,	:	Civil Action No.
v.	:	2:12-cv-00262-WCO
	:	
RAJESH PATEL,	:	
	:	
Defendant.		

# **NOTICE OF DEPOSITION OF MARK LUTZ**

TO: Jacques Nazaire 125 Town Park Drive

Kennesaw, GA 30144

Pursuant to Fed R. Civ. P. Rule 30, please take notice that Defendant, by and through counsel, will take the deposition by oral examination of Mark Lutz on August 21, 2013 at 09:00 AM at the State Bar of Georgia, Room 6, located at 104 Marietta St. NW, Atlanta, GA 30303. The deposition will be recorded via audio and audiovisual. This deposition is taken for all purposes allowed under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Court's order permitting discovery. This is not a deposition notice wherein, pursuant to Rule 30(b)(6), Plaintiff may "designate one or more officers, directors, or managing agents, or designate other persons who consent to testify on its behalf; and it may set out the matters on which each person designated will testify." See generally E.I. DuPon de Nemours and Co. v. Kolon Industries, Inc., 268 F.R.D. 45, 48-49 (E.D. Va. 2010) (extensive discussion of factors relevant to determining whether a witness is a managing agent); Calixto v. Watson Bowman Acme Corp., 2008 WL 4487679, \* 2-3 (S.D. Fla. 2008) (engaging in a fact-specific analysis to determine if witness was a managing agent); Vision Center Northwest Inc. v. Vision Value LLC, 2008 WL 4276240, \*2-3 (N.D. Ind. 2008, affd 2008 WL 4724722 (N.D. Ind. 2008) (discussing and applying factors relevant to determining whether a witness is a managing agent); Phillips v. American Honda Motor Co., Inc. 2005 WL 1527685, \*1 (S.D. Ala. 2005); Cadent Ltd. v. 3M Unitek Corp., 232 F.R.D. 625, 628 (C.D. Cal. 2005) (notice sufficient to compel production of officer, director, or managing agent); Stone v. Morton Intl., Inc., 170 F.R.D. 498, 503-04 (D. Utah 1997)).

-6986	EXHIBIT
PENGAD 800-631-6989	1
GAD 8	Luiz
PEN	B-2

Compare O'Connor v. Trans Union Corp., No. 97-cv-4633, 1998 WL 372667, at \*2 (E.D. Pa. May 11, 1998) (lower level employees must be subpoenaed).

Signed this 22 day of July, 2013:

2483 Shoals Ter. Decatur, GA 30034 404-579-9668 No Fax Number <u>bchintel1@gmail.com</u>

**BLAIR CHINTELLA** 

20

Georgia Bar No. 510109 Attorney for Defendant

AF HOLDINGS, LLC	:
Plaintiff,	
V.	: Civil Action No.
RAJESH PATEL,	: 2:12-cv-00262-WCO
Defendant.	· :

## [Proposed] Order

It is hereby ordered that [ ] Plaintiff and/or [ ] Jacques Nazaire and/or [ ] Mark Lutz to pay Mr. Patel the amount of [ ] \$2,260 and/or [ ]

for attorneys' fees associated with 11.3 hours of legal work associated with bringing Defendant's Motion for Sanctions for Mark Lutz's Failure to Appear at his Deposition, and such liability be joint and several. It is also ordered that the same persons are jointly and severally liable for \$108.70, which is the expense for the Wheeler Reporting Company service.

It is further ordered that pursuant to Rule 37(b)(2)(A):

- Plaintiff is prohibited from opposing Defendant's motions for sanctions (# 16, 30);
- That it is deemed admitted that the assignment agreement in this contains a forged signature of "Alan Cooper" and "Raymond Rogers;"

- Plaintiff's motions for sanctions (ECF # 20, 21) are dismissed and/or Plaintiff is prohibited from asserting them; and
- Mr. Lutz is held in contempt of Court and is liable to Defendant in the amount of \$500 per day until he purges himself of contempt by arranging for his deposition to be taken by Defendant in this matter.

It is so ordered this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2013:

William C. O'Kelley Judge United States District Court for the Northern District of Georgia